



PROJECT MUSE®

---

To Mary in Aotearoa: Burns's 'Thou Ling'ring Star' and  
Scottish Identity in New Zealand

Nikki Hessel, Stephen Clothier

Scottish Literary Review, Volume 9, Number 2, Autumn/Winter 2017, pp.  
41-56 (Article)

Published by Association for Scottish Literary Studies



➔ For additional information about this article

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/678040>

NIKKI HESSELL AND STEPHEN CLOTHIER

---

To Mary in Aotearoa: Burns's 'Thou Ling'ring Star' and  
Scottish Identity in New Zealand

---

**Abstract**

Robert Burns's poetic address 'To Mary in Heaven', also known as 'Thou Ling'ring Star', was once immensely popular among Scottish expatriates and Burns enthusiasts in British colonies. Unusually for Burns, it is written in a highly formal mode of English, and set to a deliberately composed tune rather than one 'found' in the context of traditional Scottish musical culture. In New Zealand, it has an extensive history of performance, in verse and song, from the earliest colonial period through to the aftermath of the First World War. An investigation into the poem's reception in early colonial New Zealand reveals the works of Burns to be not just 'a symphony and a synthesis of Scottish song and nationality', as some contemporary commentators suggested, but the foundation upon which a new, transcultural Scots–New Zealand cultural identity could be established.

This essay uses nineteenth- and early twentieth-century New Zealand newspapers to map the ways in which 'Thou Ling'ring Star' was used by emigrant Scottish communities. It engages with critical debates about the diasporic Burns to argue for the importance of "minor" Burns pieces in that diaspora.

On Burns Night 1913, the Wellington Scottish Society gathered to listen for a lecture on the poet and an evening of song and dance. After Miss Betty Purdom had given a recitation of 'The Little Scotch Martyrs', she was 'loudly recalled' by the audience to perform an encore. According to the *Evening Post*, Purdom 'responded with "To Mary in Heaven"'.<sup>1</sup> Burns, as Tanja Bueltmann has argued, was an important site of cultural memory in New Zealand, but the specific version of the poet and the specific texts that appealed to early New Zealand settlers have not been considered in any

detail.<sup>2</sup> ‘To Mary in Heaven’ (sometimes called ‘Thou Ling’ring Star’) was once immensely popular within the colonial Scottish diaspora. In New Zealand, it has an extensive history of performance, in both verse and song, from the earliest colonial period to the aftermath of the First World War. Although it has fallen out of favour in modern criticism, its reception in colonial New Zealand reveals the poem to be part of the foundation upon which a new, transcultural, identity could be established and expressed by the Scottish diaspora in the South Pacific.<sup>3</sup> This transcultural identity would have to take account of the relationship between a new Southern Hemisphere homeland and an old Northern Hemisphere one, but also between regional differences in both places.

The general opinion of recent scholars regarding ‘To Mary in Heaven’ is decidedly negative. When it is acknowledged at all in scholarship dealing with Burns’s output, it is considered one of his rare poetic failures. Burns’s uncharacteristic use of a lofty and deliberately ‘poetic’ English in ‘To Mary in Heaven’, rather than the Scots dialect of most of his poetry, has led to it being universally reviled by twentieth-century critics, who find it ‘strained [. . .] verg[ing] on hysteria’ and ‘deliberately manufactured’.<sup>4</sup> Thomas Crawford attributes this perceived ‘lessening in quality’ in Burns’s English poems to a ‘linguistic split’ in eighteenth-century Scotland that saw English and Scots as occupying two different social dimensions. He argues, in short, that there was a profound dissociation of reason and emotion, whereby the unspoken rule became: ‘think in English, feel in Scots, and never the twain shall meet’.<sup>5</sup> He attributes different levels of cultural value to Burns’s literary output depending on its linguistic qualities, maintaining that:

Burns was the victim of this split, which indeed determined the qualities of his poetry – good when it was in Scots and deals with simple, everyday emotions, or with comic or realistically treated subjects, but bad when it is in English and concerned with lofty and sublime emotions, or with ratiocination.<sup>6</sup>

Even the burgeoning field of scholarship on Burns’s songs has not led to a resurgence of critical interest in the qualities of this once-loved text.<sup>7</sup>

This negative critical consensus contrasts markedly with the genuine popularity ‘To Mary in Heaven’ appears to have achieved in early colonial New Zealand and other communities of diasporic Scots around the world.<sup>8</sup>

An investigation of the *Papers Past* database, which includes New Zealand's newspapers and periodicals from the late 1830s through to 1948, reveals 213 individual references to the poem. These references cover a wide variety of media, including advertisements, reviews of concerts and lectures, letters to the editor, general interest articles, miscellaneous columns, and news articles. If Burns's legacy indeed resides, as Murray Pittock suggests, in the trans-cultural and intercultural practices of colonial and postcolonial societies, then it would seem likely that the early periodicals of this colonial society would be the ideal pathway through which to reimagine a Pacific Burns.<sup>9</sup> In this essay, we examine the uses to which this particular poem was put in the diasporic communities of New Zealand and the ways in which its particular qualities made it attractive to the development of a new Scottish–New Zealand identity.

'To Mary in Heaven' appeared, usually alongside a suite of other Burns songs and poems, in a range of community activities in colonial New Zealand, at a time when at least twenty per cent of all migrants to New Zealand came from Scotland.<sup>10</sup> Some of these were fund-raising endeavours, especially in areas with high Scottish populations: for example, concerts in support of the Awamoko School Board, and the construction of a proposed Horticultural Hall in Matura, both in small settlements in Otago, featured performances of Burns's song that attracted large crowds.<sup>11</sup> Others were elocutionary competitions, in which 'To Mary in Heaven' was a popular set-piece. In one such competition hosted by the Vivian Street Mutual Improvement Society in Wellington in 1884, the poem was used as a tie-breaker to decide the winner.<sup>12</sup> Most frequently, and predictably, 'To Mary in Heaven' appeared on programmes run by Scottish cultural groups such as the various Burns Clubs and Caledonian Societies that existed throughout New Zealand.<sup>13</sup> The Dunedin Burns Club, for example, planned to run a competition for children in 1908 in which the girls would be required to recite 'To Mary in Heaven' and 'Highland Mary'.<sup>14</sup>

These examples indicate that 'To Mary in Heaven' circulated as both poetry and song in New Zealand. Sometimes the form of the rendition is entirely clear: a Mr Connal conducted a reading of the poem at an event in Christchurch in July 1871 that was met 'with rapturous applause', for example, while the touring singer Jessie Maclachlan, 'the Queen of Scottish song', was especially praised for her handling of this piece.<sup>15</sup> Other examples demonstrate the way in which song and speech mixed in the New

Zealand performances of the poem, such as the night on which George Brownlee sang Burns's song, accompanied by his daughter on the piano, as part of a lecture on 'The Songs and Ballads of Scotland' in Oamaru in September 1888.<sup>16</sup> This mixture of spoken and sung renditions continued as technology advanced; radio broadcasts of the 1930s featured both recitals and musical performances of 'To Mary in Heaven'.<sup>17</sup> Travelling performers, many of whom attracted huge audiences, would often include the poem in their repertoire. Thomas Bracken, better known as the author of the English verses of the New Zealand national anthem, toured both the North and South Islands in 1884 with a popular show that featured 'To Mary in Heaven' as the only composition by Burns and that met with 'enthusiastic success throughout the colony'.<sup>18</sup> The Scottish opera star Durward Lely had similar success in 1898 when he performed his 'Rantin' Rovin' Robin' show around the country, with particular praise reserved by the reviewers for his rendition of 'To Mary in Heaven'.<sup>19</sup> Praise was also heaped on Jean Howison's performance of the poem as she toured New Zealand in 1908, with one reviewer noting that 'the gem of the night was the recital of the unsurpassable lines, "To Mary in Heaven". In this Miss Howison displayed an intensity of feeling and pathos not readily to be forgotten.'<sup>20</sup> Lectures on Burns were common, and frequently featured a discussion, recital, or musical performance of the poem.<sup>21</sup> These instances all suggest that the poem was popular and familiar enough to draw crowds, raise money, and provide the focal point for community groups wishing to assert their Scottish roots in the colony.

The centrality of 'To Mary in Heaven' to that effort can be felt when new Scottish settlements emerged. Predictably, most references to the poem were found in newspapers from areas of high Scottish settlement, with the vast majority (78) being from the Otago region, followed by Auckland (36 references, likely due to the large general population), Canterbury (26), and Wellington (22). But small spikes in regional references tell the story of internal Scottish migration. In the 1890s, for example, technological advances in the extraction of gold in the Waikato region drew miners away from the established Scottish centres in southern New Zealand.<sup>22</sup> The smattering of references to the poem that occurred in Thames newspapers prior to the Waikato gold strike was replaced with a regular and sustained burst of interest in the 1890s. This burst began with Thomas Bracken's visit to the Thames Burns Club in 1891, where his recitation of 'To Mary in

Heaven' was so well-received that the audience demanded an encore.<sup>23</sup> By 1893, the Thames Burns Club had launched an annual competition that included a recitation contest: the inaugural prize for children was won by Miss H. M. Gibb for her performance of 'To Mary in Heaven'.<sup>24</sup> A different Miss Gibb recited the poem at the Club's concert in 1896, held in commemoration of the centenary of Burns's death, one of many such events around the country.<sup>25</sup> The miners themselves invited the lecturer A. H. Waddell to speak to them about Burns at an 1897 event that was so popular that '[e]ach camp was crowded to the doors, and the open air had to be resorted to'.<sup>26</sup> Waddell recited 'To Mary in Heaven' alongside poems which are much more firmly situated in the modern critical Burns canon, such as 'The Cotter's Saturday Night', 'Tam o'Shanter' and 'A man's a man for a' that'. The miners were being invited to see Burns as a key element of their own identity, not simply as Scots but as Scottish New Zealanders, with Waddell proclaiming '[w]hat glorious poems Burns would have made on these mines [. . .]'.<sup>27</sup> In the Waikato mining towns, a new colonial Scottish identity was being formed with Burns, and 'To Mary in Heaven', at the centre.

Local identity was only one aspect of the poem's usefulness, however. It also appeared in situations where Scottish New Zealanders attempted to connect their newly forged colonial identity with the wider network of the Scottish diaspora, and with a broader global identity, in a way that is consistent with the findings of recent scholarship on Burns and transnational culture.<sup>28</sup> The most tangible manifestation of the poem's significance for Scots–New Zealanders can be seen in the way Burns was represented in the famous Dunedin statue. On 18 May 1885, the *Otago Daily Times* announced that a statue of Burns in the act of composing 'To Mary in Heaven' that the Dunedin City Council had commissioned was now ready to be transported to New Zealand from Edinburgh. The posture of the statue, the paper reported, was 'easy, yet dignified, and the expression of the features convey the idea of deep thought combined with intellectual gifts'.<sup>29</sup> There was also a great deal of interest in similar memorials overseas: New Zealand readers were informed about the statues of Burns in the act of composing 'To Mary in Heaven' that had been erected in London, New York and Dundee.<sup>30</sup> When a statue of Mary Campbell was erected in Dunoon, in a ceremony that featured a musical performance of 'To Mary in Heaven', New Zealand was represented by the MP William McCullough, who

proudly described the Burns Clubs of New Zealand as institutions which ‘helped to bind the ties between the Mother country and her Colonies over the sea. They encouraged young people of the colonies who had never seen the Mother country to cherish the associations of their parents, and to study the works of those who had made her great’.<sup>31</sup> A statuette modelled on the Dunoon statue was soon proudly displayed by the Auckland Burns Club, ‘to commemorate the genius that composed the lines “To Mary in Heaven”’, and there are suggestions that Scottish New Zealanders contemplated building their own statue to Campbell in New Zealand, prompting a wry question by a self-identified member of the Scots diaspora in the *New Zealand Herald*:

If we are to erect a monument to Highland Mary, as the inspirer of ‘Thou lingering star, with lessening ray’, why not to those many other sweethearts of the poet, who had so powerful an influence over his genius? But if Scotchmen took that in hand, the subjects they would have to deal with would be found so numerous that the price of monumental marble would infallibly go up.<sup>32</sup>

In New Zealand, to imagine Burns, and memorialise him, was to associate him with ‘To Mary in Heaven’, but also to tap in to a particular strand of the global Burns tradition.<sup>33</sup>

This global tradition might help explain why ‘To Mary in Heaven’ featured in the somewhat unlikely context of New Zealand’s role in the two World Wars. In January 1916, in the wake of the Gallipoli campaign, the Dunedin Burns Club held its Burns night as usual, but with a decided focus on the ongoing war in Europe. The lecture for the evening was on ‘Burns as a Patriot’, and many of the poems and songs that might be readily termed patriotic were performed. But so too was ‘To Mary in Heaven’, as part of a lamentation for a generic ‘New Zealander who, in returning from the historic landing at Gallipoli, riddled with bullets, cheered with his last breath’.<sup>34</sup> The idea of a sentimental, suffering Burns was as important to the maintenance of a global diasporic identity as was the militant nationalistic Burns. To communities grieving in the wake of the losses at Gallipoli, ‘To Mary in Heaven’ offered a reflection of a new, sorrowful identity that linked itself with other similarly affected communities across the Empire.

The desire for a wider global community might also explain why ‘To

Mary in Heaven' was on the programme for the Wellington Burns Club in January 1939. On the eve of war, the Club's President, R. H. Nimmo, declared to the audience of over 170 that 'It is fitting tonight, in the Capital City of New Zealand, that we and other New Zealanders throughout the length and breadth of the land form living links in the chain of fellowship that encircles the globe, and drink tonight in the fullness of joy to the immortal memory of Robert Burns.'<sup>35</sup> The poem sits here alongside a call for national unity, for a single 'New Zealand' identity, and for global fellowship in a time of conflict.

But the early New Zealand newspapers provide evidence of a sentiment beyond popularity, nostalgia, familiarity, or globalisation. 'To Mary in Heaven' was often held up in the papers as an example of Burns at his best. The poem was a 'master piece', 'the greatest lyric in our language', and one that 'ranks by universal consent as one of [Burns's] very finest inspirations'.<sup>36</sup> Its opening lines were included in a selection of favourite quotations, chosen by readers, alongside lines from Shakespeare and Milton as illustrations of the most familiar English texts.<sup>37</sup> Sometimes, Burns's accessibility was held up as evidence of his superiority to the great canonical names of English literature; one correspondent suggested to his local newspaper that the poem's four stanzas 'are alone worth [Tennyson's] *In Memoriam* a dozen times told', while another wrote that 'men and women who could not read "L'Allegro" and "Il Pensero", to say nothing of "Lycidas" or "Paradise Lost", open their hearts when Burns sings to them of "Bonny Doon", or weep over his hymn "To Mary in Heaven."<sup>38</sup> The British lecturer David Christie Murray was reported in the New Zealand papers to have called the poem 'an example of the best writing in the way of simple piety', and linked it explicitly with the diasporic Scottish community, noting that 'while Scots were pre-eminently fond of their natal soil, their love of adventure drove them into exile, and Burns was the man who sang to them of home [. . .]'.<sup>39</sup> The poem was so highly regarded that when the *Otago Witness* reprinted a critique of the poem from an international periodical, it headlined the piece 'A Heretical Criticism'.<sup>40</sup> This widely-held belief that the poem was Burns's finest work gestures to something beyond strategic deployment in moments when money needed to be raised or sentiment invoked, but rather its fundamental (and possibly unique) importance as a text in the formation of a Scottish–New Zealand identity.

One of the aspects of the poem that has made least popular with modern critics was a significant element in its success with colonial New Zealand audiences. Burns's deployment of poetic English was frequently addressed by commentators in New Zealand, particularly in the early decades of the twentieth century. Some preferred the Scots-language poems but made a special exception for 'To Mary in Heaven', such as the lecturer who, having declared that Burns's best poetry was written in 'our guid auld Scotch', nevertheless asked 'Can you think of any lines in the English language where the passion of love in its purest form was ever better expressed than in his immortal lines "To Mary in Heaven"?'<sup>41</sup> Others seemed less aware of the contradiction between their affection for this poem and their general attachment to Scottish music; one letter to the editor of the *Hawera & Normanby Star* in Taranaki hopes that the upcoming Caledonian Society concert will include 'a large percentage of beautiful Scotch lyrics' but names 'To Mary in Heaven' as a song that he or she particularly hoping to hear.<sup>42</sup> Some regarded it as important to defend this poem as part of a wider defence of Burns's talent, treating his skilful use of English in 'To Mary in Heaven' as evidence of his bilingual genius.<sup>43</sup> The question of Burns's language was so popular that a discussion of it could feature in a column titled 'Topics of the Day' in the Christchurch *Press*, which championed the poem as an accessible way into Burns for average Anglophone readers and 'easiness itself' compared to Burns's Scots works.<sup>44</sup> The poem did not alienate readers without Scots, but it also, as the Australian author J. H. L. Zillmann wrote in an article published in the *NZ Truth*, did not alienate readers who preferred Scots verse.<sup>45</sup>

The poem was also, perhaps unexpectedly, held up as an example of a suitably moral text. Journalists emphasised the religious connection between Burns and Mary Campbell, symbolised in the exchange of Bibles.<sup>46</sup> The affection between the lovers was often described as 'tender' or 'pure', with implications of an appropriately constrained passion; on Burns Night in 1935, David McLaren told the Wellington Burns Club that 'To Mary in Heaven' 'was a song to be read or sung in private, so pure and holy were the feelings expressed'.<sup>47</sup> Some of this praise was expressed alongside condemnation of the poet's infidelity, but these comments typically upheld the quality and value of the poem itself.<sup>48</sup> One correspondent went as far as to recommend it to young readers, both for its morality and the accessibility of its language:

I fancy that few New Zealand boys and girls, even in this Scottish portion of our Dominion, have made the acquaintance of Burns. With many of your parents it will be quite different. I can, however, sympathise with you, for the Scottish language is almost unknown to you. [. . .] But Burns' 'To Mary in Heaven', is a poem you should not only read but learn off by heart. It is exquisite in both thought and expression. It belongs in literature to those works called the Immortals. Never shall its glory fade.<sup>49</sup>

One way to understand the poem's status as an icon for Scottish New Zealanders is to locate it within the broader question of the Scottish diaspora. It provides a flexibility that can accommodate the challenges of generating a diasporic identity.<sup>50</sup> It is a composition by the most Scottish of authors, but written in standard English. It is both a song and a poem, and members of the diaspora can deploy it as either, or both. It embodies moral virtue and a safely contained eroticism. It speaks to the particular character of the Scottish diaspora but also to a global identity that exists beyond ties to either nations of birth or adopted homes. It is a song for public consumption and private contemplation. One could argue that modern readings of Burns want something far more limited from his work: a starker sense of his position on sex, politics, language, and literature, which can be more easily accommodated within contemporary critical debates. The Scots of colonial New Zealand, by contrast, might have been able to take a more flexible view of Burns, and thus a more generous view of a poem like 'To Mary in Heaven'. As Gerard Carruthers has argued in the case of Burns's transatlantic influence, the politics of the 'Old World' lacked urgency in colonial contexts, and allowed different aspects of Burns's legacy to take precedence.<sup>51</sup> For the Scots in New Zealand, a depoliticised Burns was a useful tool for community-making and a public declaration of values that distinguished members of the Scottish diaspora from, for example, the more overtly political Irish immigrants to New Zealand.<sup>52</sup>

Perhaps the best example of how diasporic Scots used 'To Mary in Heaven' to symbolise their new life in New Zealand can be found in the short story 'Dancing and Singing', published in the *Otago Witness* in 1909.<sup>53</sup> The author was the women's rights campaigner Wilhelmina Sherriff Bain, herself a member of the Scottish diaspora. Born in Midlothian around 1845, she had moved to Invercargill in the 1850s with her parents to be reunited with her older brother, who had emigrated previously.<sup>54</sup>

The story begins with the kind of community-building activity that the song frequently seemed to accompany in nineteenth and early twentieth-century New Zealand:

Rainy gusts had swept the little village all day, and when night fell the moon had a wild and watery look. Yet the young folk pressed on with their work, in sure anticipation of a happy evening. There had not been a social for months, and wind and rain and dirty roads were not likely to daunt them. It did seem for a time as if nobody were coming to the big drillshed. The chairman of the committee looked a bit worried; but some of the members flustered about, arranging the biggest illumination that three swing lamps could throw upon rough rafters and flag-adorned walls, sprinkling the floor, and opening the upper sashes of the windows, with fine faith in festivity.

The story focuses on Jeanie Seton, a young girl who has ‘started visiting Dunedin twice a week to receive singing lessons’ and is in love with a local youth, James Arundel. Unbeknownst to her devoted father, Jeannie will be giving her first public performance at the social, and ‘does not know what she may sing’. Her uncle is the MC for the evening, and intends to call her up to sing one of the songs in ‘her Scotch song book, first having blue-pencilled every song that she knows thoroughly well in its melody and in its words’. When Jeannie gets up to sing, she ‘struggles with a conscious sense of double personality’ as she expresses her own feelings for James via a song from ‘the heathery mists of a long past century’. This uneasy combination of a present-day New Zealand identity and a historical Scottish one is manifested in the sound of her voice; in a duet with James, she sings her part of the traditional ‘Huntingtower’ ‘as never before human voice has been heard in Arima. In like manner the tuis may have chanted, even thus the mokomoko may have chimed, ere yet the shames and crimes of civilization had begun to extirpate New Zealand’s heavenly choristers.’

But the climax of the story occurs later, when Jeannie and her father return home to their family sitting-room:

A corner of the room was dedicated to Robert Burns. There was his picture – there his bust in Parisian marble, and there his poems on a moveable stand. Jeanie lingered by that corner as she went to the

piano, and then, looking up to the portrait of her mother, she sang 'To Mary in heaven.' [*sic*]

The passion and the pathos of her tones vibrated in the soul of the strong man sitting there by the fire. 'O Mary; dear departed shade.' How often – how often had he pored over that lamentation of lamentations! To-night other feelings blend with his sacred sorrow. Jeanie's exquisite singing soothes him, comforts him, interprets him to himself.

'To Mary in Heaven' is used in this story as a vehicle to reconcile the identity struggle of Jeanie and other Scottish New Zealanders, in part because it seems to both encapsulate and reach beyond identity politics into a zone of apparently universal human sympathies. It provides an interpretation of Mr Seton's identity that he can comprehend and from which he receives comfort. This identity is domestic, private, and emotional, separate from but complementary to the kind of public identity of the Scottish New Zealanders that is forged in the raucous atmosphere of the social. It interprets Mr Seton, and the diasporic Scots he represents, to themselves, in a way that is quite explicitly soothing and non-confrontational. It is thus a kind of balm for diaspora.

There are various Burns canons that circulate through time and space, changing based on fashion and need. The colonial canon is one of these, and its contours overlap with but do not match those of either the scholarly or the popular Burns canons of the twenty-first century. Yet the vast reach of the Scottish diaspora means that this canon touches all parts of the former Empire and continues to shape the identities of its modern, post-imperial citizens. If 'To Mary in Heaven' was regarded as the apex of the colonial canon by diasporic Scots, contemporary scholarship needs to consider what that fact can teach us about community-making and identity in previous centuries and the traces of these activities in present-day societies.

It is also important to consider trends within the colonial canon. Predictably, the focus of global Burns studies has been on his influence in America. But the New Zealand context has the potential to add to burgeoning critical interest in the transpacific Scottish experience, and how it might work alongside, or in contrast to, other global patterns, such as transatlantic ones. The transpacific Burns is likely to share characteristics with, say, the transatlantic Burns, but also to highlight new appropriations and approaches arising from the specifics of the Pacific diaspora.

## Notes

- 1 ‘Scotch Concert’, *Evening Post*, 28 January 1913, p. 2.
- 2 Tanja Bueltmann, *Scottish Ethnicity and the Making of New Zealand Society, 1850–1930* (Edinburgh, 2011), p. 2. See also Brad Patterson, Tom Brooking, Jim McAloon, Rebecca Lenihan, and Tanja Bueltmann, *Unpacking the Kists: the Scots in New Zealand* (Montreal and Kingston, 2013), pp. 179–81.
- 3 For general overviews of the Scots in New Zealand, see (in addition to the works mentioned in note 2), Tom Brooking and Jennie Coleman (eds), *The Heather and the Fern: Scottish Migration and New Zealand Settlement* (Dunedin, 2003); Rebecca Lenihan, *From Alba to Aotearoa: Profiling New Zealand’s Scots Migrants, 1840–1920* (Dunedin, 2015); Angela McCarthy, *Scottishness and Irishness in New Zealand Since 1840* (Manchester and New York, 2011); John M. MacKenzie and Brad Patterson, ‘The New Zealand Scots in International Perspective: An Introduction’, *Immigrants & Minorities* 29.2 (2011), 147–53; Marjory Harper, ‘A Century of Scottish Immigration to New Zealand’, *Immigrants & Minorities* 29.2 (2011), 220–39; Angela McCarthy, ‘“Frugal and Thrifty, Hardworking and Sober”: Representations of Scottishness in New Zealand’, *Immigrants & Minorities* 30.1 (2012), 1–21; Tom Brooking, ‘Weaving the Tartan into the Flax: Networks, Identities, and Scottish Migration to Nineteenth-Century Otago, New Zealand’, in *A Global Clan: Scottish Migrant Networks and Identities since the Eighteenth Century*, ed. by Angela McCarthy (London, 2006), pp. 183–202.
- 4 Catarina Ericson-Roos, *The Songs of Robert Burns: A Study of the Unity of Poetry and Music*, (Uppsala, 1977), p. 94, and Thomas Crawford, *Burns: A Study of the Poems and Songs*, 2nd ed. (Edinburgh and London, 1965), p. 268, respectively.
- 5 Crawford, p. xi.
- 6 Crawford pp. xi–xii.
- 7 James Kinsley’s edition of *The Poems and Songs of Robert Burns* (Oxford, 1968) and Donald A. Low’s more recent *The Songs of Robert Burns* (London, 1993) both provide a foundation for detailed scholarship. This scholarship has been led by critics such as Kirsteen McCue, who laments that ‘the largest single body of [Burns’s] work – his songs – is still underrated and often misunderstood’ in ‘Burns, Women, and Song’, in *Robert Burns and Cultural Authority*, ed. by Robert Crawford (Iowa City, 1997), pp. 40–57 (p. 40). Even detailed scholarship on the songs such as McCue’s, however, does not have anything to say about ‘To Mary in Heaven’; see both ‘Burns, Women, and Song’, and ‘Burns’s Songs and Poetic Craft’, in *The Edinburgh Companion to Robert Burns*, ed. by Gerard Carruthers (Edinburgh, 2009), pp. 74–85.
- 8 See for example Carol McQuirk’s comment that the ‘Highland Mary’ group of songs now seem like ‘an odd choice to stand as exemplary of Burns’s genius’ as they did in the nineteenth-century colonial world in McQuirk, ‘Haunted by Authority: Nineteenth-Century American Constructions of Robert Burns and Scotland’, in *Robert Burns and Cultural Authority*, ed. by Robert Crawford (Edinburgh, 1997), pp. 136–58 (p. 147).
- 9 Murray Pittock, ‘Introduction: Global Burns’, in *Robert Burns in Global Literature*, ed. by Murray Pittock (Lewisburg, 2011), pp. 13–24 (p. 19).
- 10 Bueltmann, p. 2.

- 11 'Entertainment in Awamoko', *North Otago Times*, 28 May 1888, p. 3 and 'Concert at Maitai', *Maitai Ensign*, 3 September 1898, p. 2, respectively. More information about Scottish music in New Zealand can be found in Jennie Coleman, 'Ceòl Mòr of the South: Theme and Variation on an Immigrant Music Culture', in *The Heather and the Fern: Scottish Migration and New Zealand Settlement*, ed. by Tom Brooking and Jennie Coleman (Dunedin, 2003), pp. 133–52. McCarthy discusses the music played by Scottish immigrants on the voyage to New Zealand in *Scottishness and Irishness*, pp. 90–95.
- 12 [Advertisement], *Evening Post*, 5 August 1884, p. 2.
- 13 See for example the Auckland Burns Club's celebrations of St. Andrew's Day in the *Auckland Star*, 4 December 1891, p. 2. For a discussion of the associationalism of Scottish New Zealanders, see Bueltmann, pp. 64–93.
- 14 'Burns Club: Annual Report', *Otago Daily Times*, 20 March 1908, p. 7.
- 15 'News of the Day', *The Press*, 22 July 1871, p. 2, and 'The Jessie Maclachlan Concerts', *Otago Daily Times*, 26 September 1905, p. 6, respectively. Reviews of Maclachlan's concerts frequently mentioned 'To Mary in Heaven' as a highlight; see for example 'Amusements: Miss Maclachlan's Concerts', *Auckland Star*, 13 October 1905, p. 2; 'Entertainments: Miss Jessie Maclachlan', *New Zealand Herald*, 13 October 1905, p. 6; 'His Majesty's Theatre: The Jessie Maclachlan Concerts', *Otago Witness*, 1 November 1905, p. 61. For further examples of spoken performances of the poem, see 'Local Intelligence', *Nelson Examiner and New Zealand Chronicle*, 18 June 1856, p. 2; 'Elocutionary Entertainment', *Bruce Herald*, 4 March 1881, p. 3; 'Local and General News', *New Zealand Herald*, 26 January 1895, p. 4; 'Local and General News', *New Zealand Herald*, 18 October 1895, p. 4; 'Pokeno', *New Zealand Herald*, 8 January 1897, p. 6. For further examples of the poem being performed as a song, see 'Burns' Night', *Feilding Star*, 26 January 1904, p. 2; 'Burns Anniversary', *Otago Witness*, 30 January 1907, p. 65; 'A Braw Scotch Nicht', *Otago Daily Times*, 16 September 1910, p. 6; 'St. Andrew's Society', *New Zealand Herald*, 24 January 1911, p. 10; 'Burns Concert', *Timaru Herald*, 24 January 1914, p. 1.
- 16 [Untitled article], *Oamaru Mail*, 1 October 1888, p. 2; see also the account of the Rev. J. D. McKenzie's lecture in Wanganui, 'A Night with Burns', *Wanganui Chronicle*, 29 August 1910, p. 5, which was accompanied by a performance of the song. An interesting example of the reverse phenomenon can be seen in an advertisement for a Burns Anniversary celebration in Auckland in 1892, featuring 'Haggis and Bagpipes, Concert and Ball', in which 'To Mary in Heaven' is the only one of Burns's songs that is listed as a 'Recitation': 'Amusements', *New Zealand Herald*, 23 January 1892, p. 8.
- 17 For an example of a recital, see 'Wireless Programmes: This Evening's Broadcasts', *The New Zealand Herald*, 1 September 1930, p. 15. For an example of a song, see this announcement of the tenor James Shaw's radio performance, as part of the annual Burns night celebrations: 'Radio Programmes', *Evening Post*, 24 January 1931, p. 6.
- 18 [Notices], *Feilding Star*, 18 November 1884, p. 3. The same advertisement featured in papers throughout the country.
- 19 The reviewer in the *Otago Daily Times* described the 'exquisite taste' with which 'Thou lingering star' was sung; see 'Mr Durward Lely', *Otago Daily Times*, 3 May 1898, p. 2. Lely's performance of Burns's song was also singled out by reviewers in the *Southland Times* (27 April 1898, p. 2); the *Christchurch Press* (11 May 1898, p. 5); the *Auckland Star* (1 June 1898, p. 2); and *The New Zealand Herald* (1 June 1898, p. 5). The *Southland Times* reviewer made the comment that 'Flow gently, sweet Afton' and

- 'Thou lingering star' were the songs that received the most 'rapt attention' from the audience.
- 20 'Miss Howison's Lecture', *Wairarapa Daily Times*, 17 June 1908, p. 5. See also 'Dramatic Recital', *The Press*, 18 March 1908, p. 7; "'A Nicht Wi' Burns'", *Poverty Bay Herald*, 6 February 1909, p. 7; 'Miss Jean Howison', *Ashburton Guardian*, 17 April 1909, p. 2; 'Miss Jean Howison', *Timaru Herald*, 8 May 1909, p. 3; 'Miss Jean Howison', *North Otago Times*, 18 May 1909, p. 1; 'An Evening with Robert Burns', *North Otago Times*, 21 May 1909, p. 3; 'Miss Jean Howison', *Oamaru Mail*, 21 May 1909, p. 4.
  - 21 See for example 'The Rev. J. W. Inglis on Robert Burns', *Southland Times*, 10 January 1879, p. 2; 'Songs and Ballads of Scotland', *Oamaru Mail*, 16 April 1880, p. 2; 'Elocutionary Entertainment', *Bruce Herald*, 4 March 1881, p. 3; [Untitled article], *Auckland Star*, 2 June 1882, p. 2; 'Kingsdown Literary Society', *Timaru Herald*, 17 September 1900, p. 3; 'Lecture on "Scottish Song"', *Tuapeka Times*, 22 June 1907, p. 3; 'Scottish Song: Mr. Hart's Lecture', *Otago Daily Times*, 5 June 1908, p. 2.
  - 22 Mark Derby, *Waibeatbens: Voices from a Mining Town* (Warkworth, 2012), p. 18. For more detail on the Scots and mining in New Zealand, see Terry Hearn, 'Scots Miners in the Goldfields, 1861-1870', in *The Heather and the Fern: Scottish Migration and New Zealand Settlement*, ed. by Tom Brooking and Jennie Coleman (Dunedin, 2003), pp. 67-85.
  - 23 [Untitled article], *Thames Advertiser*, 19 June 1891, p. 2.
  - 24 'Burns Club: Competition for Prizes', *Thames Advertiser*, 9 December 1893, p. 2.
  - 25 'The Burns Club', *Thames Advertiser*, 22 July 1896, p. 2.
  - 26 'Popular Lectures to Miners', *Thames Advertiser*, 27 January 1897, p. 3.
  - 27 'Popular Lectures to Miners', p. 3. Waddell gave concerts in other parts of New Zealand too, singing many of Burns's songs but typically reciting 'To Mary in Heaven'. See for example the advertisement 'Scotch Concert Monday Night', *Tuapeka Times*, 18 November 1899, p. 2.
  - 28 See for example Penny Fielding, *Scotland and the Fictions of Geography: North Britain, 1760-1830* (Cambridge, 2008), esp. pp. 40-70; Leith Davis, Holly Faith Nelson, and Sharon Alker, "'Ae [Electric] Spark o' Nature's Fire": Reading Burns Across the Atlantic', in *Robert Burns and Transatlantic Culture*, ed. by Sharon Alker, Leith Davis, and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham, 2012), pp. 1-15; Steve Newman, 'Localizing and Globalizing Burns's Songs from Ayrshire to Calcutta: The Limits of Romanticism and Analogies of Improvement', in *Global Romanticism: Origins, Orientations, and Engagements, 1760-1820*, ed. by Evan Gottlieb (Lewisburg, 2015), pp. 57-77; and Leith Davis, 'Burns and Transnational Culture', in *The Edinburgh Companion to Robert Burns*, ed. by Gerard Carruthers (Edinburgh, 2009), pp. 150-63. The global appeal of Burns in a New Zealand context is considered in Bueltmann, 174-75.
  - 29 'The Burns Statue', *Otago Daily Times*, 18 May 1885, p. 3. For details of the discussions around the Dunedin statue, see also Bueltmann, 166-73.
  - 30 'The Burns Statue', p. 3. For details about the global context of Burns statues, see Michael E. Vance, 'Burns in the Park: A Tale of Three Monuments', in *Robert Burns and Transatlantic Culture*, ed. by Sharon Alker, Leith Davis and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham, 2012), pp. 209-32.
  - 31 'The Burns Centenary: Highland Mary Statue at Dunoon', *Thames Star*, 14 September 1896, p. 2. Reprinted from the *North British Daily Mail*, 3 August 1896. The plan to erect the statue in Dunoon had been followed with interest in New Zealand; see for example 'Local and General News', *New Zealand Herald*, 21 June 1895, p. 5; 'Statue of

- Highland Mary for Dunoon', *North Otago Times*, 29 May 1896, p. 1, reprinted in the *Clutha Leader*, 12 June 1896, p. 3.
- 32 [Untitled article], *Auckland Star*, 5 January 1897, p. 4; 'Local Gossip', *New Zealand Herald*, Supplement, 22 February 1896, p. 1.
- 33 See also the Minister of Lands John McKenzie's comments to the Dunedin Burns Club on Burns Night 1900, following a performance of 'To Mary in Heaven': 'I venture to say that this very night and day there have been thousands of meetings such as we have here to-night to do honour to the name of Burns, not only in the Scotch towns and villages, not only in England and Ireland, but in the great continents of America and Africa, in India and the British colonies; and not only in parts of the globe which recognise the British rule, but in many foreign countries where Burns's poems have been translated into other languages'. ('Burns's Anniversary: Dunedin Burns Club', *Otago Daily Times*, 26 January 1900, p. 3.)
- 34 'Dunedin Burns Club: Anniversary of the Poet', *Otago Daily Times*, 26 January 1916, p. 7.
- 35 'Caledonia's Poet. Tribute to Genius: Wellington Burns Club', *Evening Post*, 26 January 1939, p. 8.
- 36 'Mr W. H. Jude on Robert Burns', *Southland Times*, 10 May 1892, p. 3; 'Robert Burns', *Otago Daily Times*, Supplement, 2 July 1892, p. 1; 'The Burns Statue for New York and Dundee', *Bruce Herald*, 11 December 1877, p. 7. For other examples of the view amongst New Zealanders that this was Burns at his finest, see 'Burns's Anniversary', *Otago Daily Times*, 26 January 1872, p. 2; 'Random Notes No. III: (About Robert Burns and His Poetry)', *Southland Times*, 23 August 1879.
- 37 'Familiar Sayings', *Otago Witness*, 26 March 1881, p. 26.
- 38 'Occasional Notes', *Southland Times*, 4 August 1886, p. 3; Henry Lapham, 'Spare Half Hours', *Otago Witness*, 19 April 1884, p. 26.
- 39 'A Nicht Wi' Burns', *Otago Daily Times* 3 September 1890, p. 4.
- 40 W. E. Henley, 'To Mary in Heaven: A Heretical Criticism', *Otago Witness*, 24 March 1892, p. 43.
- 41 'A Nicht Wi' Burns: Address by Mr. J. Craigie', *Asburton Guardian*, 26 January 1906, p. 2. See also local resident C. B.'s letter to the editor of the *Nelson Evening Mail* (21 September 1918, p. 4), which asserts: 'When [Burns] wrote in English, he was seldom more than third-rate – in fact, he was but a common clever versifier. There is but one purely English poem of his which at all approaches the first rank – the lines "To Mary in Heaven".'
- 42 J. C., 'Correspondence: Scottish Songs', *Hawera & Normanby Star*, 8 December 1906, p. 7.
- 43 See for example B. S. R., 'The Alleged Illiteracy of Burns', *The Press*, 25 January 1909, p. 8. This piece is a direct response by a New Zealand correspondent to W. E. Henley's 'heretical criticism' of the poem.
- 44 'Topics of the Day', *The Press*, 25 March 1911, p. 8.
- 45 'Robert Burns: The Poet of Scotland', *NZ Truth*, 22 January 1916, p. 6.
- 46 [Untitled article], *Hawke's Bay Herald*, 24 May 1877, p. 2.
- 47 'Scotland's Bard: Burns Anniversary Celebration Supper', *Evening Post*, 28 January 1935, p. 13. For other examples, see 'Robert Burns', *Otago Witness*, 5 October 1904, p. 76; 'A Nicht Wi' Burns: Address by Mr. J. Craigie', *Asburton Guardian*, 26 January 1906, p. 2; B. S. R., 'The Alleged Illiteracy of Burns', *The Press*, 25 January 1909, p. 8. Both terms are used in praising 'To Mary in Heaven' as 'the purest and tenderest of

- [Burns's] lyrics' in 'Statue of Highland Mary for Dunoon', *North Otago Times*, 29 May 1896, p. 1.
- 48 See for example 'Book Notice: The New Chambers's Burns', *Otago Daily Times*, 21 July 1896, p. 3; 'Stories of Great Men's Loves', *Oamaru Mail*, Supplement, 19 November 1904, p. 7.
- 49 'Our Young Folks' Column', *Mataura Ensign*, 30 November 1911, p. 9.
- 50 Bueltmann stresses the flexible nature of the Burns anniversary celebrations in New Zealand, as traditions adapted to new circumstances (p. 161).
- 51 Gerard Carruthers, 'Burns's Political Reputation in North America', in *Robert Burns and Transatlantic Culture*, ed. by Sharon Alker, Leith Davis and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham, 2012), pp. 87–98 (p. 98).
- 52 For this distinction, see McCarthy, 'Frugal and Thrifty', p. 3.
- 53 Wilhelmina Sherriff Bain, 'Dancing and Singing', *Otago Witness*, 10 February 1909, p. 89.
- 54 Elsie Locke, 'BAIN, Wilhelmina Sherriff', in *Southern People: A Dictionary of Otago Southland Biography*, ed. by Jane Thomson (Dunedin, 1998), p. 19.

*Victoria University of Wellington*